

# OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL

JASON R. RAVNSBORG ATTORNEY GENERAL 1302 East Highway 14, Suite 1 Pierre, South Dakota 57501-8501 Phone (605) 773-3215 Fax (605) 773-4106 TTY (605) 773-6585 www.atg.sd.gov

CHARLES D. McGUIGAN CHIEF DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL

Sender's Email steven.blair@state.sd.us

December 28, 2020

Caleb Gilkerson 511 W. Dakota Avenue Pierre, SD 57501 Lindsey Riter-Rapp 2301 Patron Parkway Pierre, SD 57501

Re: In the Matter of Open Meeting Complaint 2020-04, Pierre City Commission, Hughes County, South Dakota

Dear Mr. Gilkerson & Ms. Riter-Rapp,

Enclosed please find proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law regarding the above referenced matter. The Commission will be holding a telephonic meeting on December 31, 2020 and will consider the findings and conclusions. A Notice of Hearing, and proposed agenda, regarding the December 31 meeting are also enclosed. As you can see from the agenda, consideration of the proposed findings and conclusions will begin at 3:00 p.m. central time or as soon thereafter as matters may be heard.

If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Steven R. Blair

Assistant Attorney General

SRB/jm Enclosures

# OPEN MEETINGS COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF OPEN	)	OMC 2020-04
MEETINGS COMPLAINT AGAINST PIERRE CITY COMMISSION –	)	NOTICE OF HEARING
HUGHES COUNTY	)	

TO: Caleb Matthew Gilkerson, 511 W. Dakota Avenue, Pierre, South Dakota 57501; Lindsey Riter-Rapp, Attorney for Pierre City Commission, 2301 Patron Parkway, Pierre, South Dakota 57501:

Please take notice that the final action to adopt the Findings of Fact,

Conclusions of Law and Decision regarding the above referenced open meetings

complaint will be held before the South Dakota Open Meetings Commission,

telephonically, on Thursday, December 31, 2020. You are not required to be

present, however, if you would like to be present the hearing will commence at 3:00

P.M. central time, and proceed in the order noted in the attached agenda. The

information necessary to access the teleconference can be found in the attached
agenda.

Dated this 28th day of December, 2020.

Steven R. Blair

Assistant Attorney General 1302 East Highway 14, Suite 1 Pierre, South Dakota 57501

Telephone: (605) 773-3215

# SOUTH DAKOTA OPEN MEETING COMMISSION

# Special Meeting Teleconference Meeting Only

#### **AGENDA**

Teleconference dial-in number: 872-240-3412 Teleconference Access Code: 602-461-397

> December 31, 2020 3:00 p.m. Central Time

- 1. Approval of the Agenda
- 2. Public Comment period as per SDCL 1-25-1
- 3. Approval of the Minutes of October 23, 2020 and December 18, 2020, meetings
- 4. Consideration of Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law
  - A. <u>In the Matter of Open Meeting Complaint 20-01, Board of Trustees for the City of Ward</u>
  - B. <u>In the Matter of Open Meeting Complaint 20-02, Belle Fourche City</u> Council
  - C. <u>In the Matter of Open Meeting Complaint 20-03, Yankton County Commission</u>
  - D. In the Matter of Open Meeting Complaint 20-04, Pierre City Commission
- 5. Scheduling future meetings

All items are scheduled for 03:00 P.M. Central Time. Scheduled items may be delayed or moved to a later agenda item at the discretion of the OMC.

Due to public health concerns relating to Covid-19, and in accord with SDCL 1-25-1.6 and Executive Orders 2020-14, 2020-16, & 2020-30, this meeting is being held via teleconference only – no physical location will be provided for the public to listen and participate. If you wish to listen or participate in this meeting please dial 872-240-3412 and enter the access code 602-461-397 when prompted.

## OPEN MEETINGS COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF OPEN MEETINGS COMPLAINT AGAINST	)	OMC 2020-04
PIERRE CITY COMMISSION – HUGHES COUNTY	) )	FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, & DECISION

The above captioned matter was heard before a quorum of the South Dakota Open Meetings Commission (Commission) on October 23, 2020.

Complainant, Caleb Gilkerson did not appear before the Commission. The Pierre City Commission appeared through counsel Lindsey Riter-Rapp. Prior to the hearing, the Commission reviewed the written submissions of the parties as well as any other exhibit, pleading or paper on file herein. Based upon the materials submitted, and the arguments of the parties, the Commission enters the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law.

# FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Commission takes official notice that the City of Pierre is located in Hughes County, South Dakota, and has been organized and operated according to applicable provisions of South Dakota Codified Law.
- 2. The Commission further takes notice that the Pierre City

  Commission is a public body elected pursuant to applicable provisions of state
  law to govern the City of Pierre.
- 3. The Pierre City Commission was scheduled to meet on April 7, 2020. On April 6, to comply with the requirements of SDCL 1-25-1.1, the

Finance Officer for the City of Pierre physically posted a copy of the April 7 agenda at the Pierre City Hall and emailed a copy of the agenda to all interested parties. The Finance Officer also attempted to publish a copy of the agenda on the Pierre city webpage (cityofpierre.org), as required by SDCL 1-25-1.1, but that attempt was unsuccessful.

- 4. According to the City Commission, when the Finance Officer attempted to publish the April 7 agenda on the City's website, a site error prevented the agenda from being able to be viewed by the public. The agenda was posted to the website in draft form only but was not published and available to be viewed by the public. This error was not noticed until the morning of April 7, at which time it was immediately corrected by the Finance Officer and the agenda was successfully published on the City's website.
- 5. In response to the failure to timely post to the website, the City Commission discussed the error with its website host. The website host has not been able to identify what prevented the agenda from being published on the City's website. The City Commission also implemented the use of a website generated confirmation to confirm publication of future agendas on the website. And, the City Commission has started the process for electronically publishing the agenda earlier in the day to ensure that time exists to identify and correct any future issues before the twenty-four-hour deadline in SDCL 1-25-1.1 expires.
  - 6. SDCL 1-25-1.1 reads in pertinent part:

Each political subdivision shall provide public notice, with proposed agenda, that is visible, readable, and accessible for at least an entire, continuous twenty-four hours immediately preceding any official meeting, by posting a copy of the notice, visible to the public, at the principal office of the political subdivision holding the meeting.... The notice shall also be posted on the political subdivision's website upon dissemination of the notice, if a website exists.

7. Any Finding of Fact more appropriately labeled as a Conclusion of Law is hereby re-designated as such and incorporated below therein.

# CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Pierre City Commission, as the governing body of the City of Pierre, South Dakota, is a public body subject to the open meeting requirements of SDCL ch. 1-25. The Open Meeting Commission has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to SDCL ch. 1-25.
- 2. SDCL 1-25-1.1 requires political subdivisions to publish proposed agendas on the political subdivision's website (if one exists) at least an "entire [and] continuous twenty-four hours immediately preceding any official meeting[.]"
- 3. It is not disputed that the City of Pierre maintains a website where agenda and meeting information is posted in the normal course of City business.
- 4. The Pierre City Commission, through their Finance Officer, undertook almost all reasonable actions necessary to comply with the requirements of SDCL 1-25-1.1. Had the Finance Officer posted the agenda earlier in the day on April 6 and checked to ensure publication prior to the

expiration of the statutory twenty-four-hour period, the Commission is confident no violation of the open meetings laws would have occurred in this instance. The Commission concludes that the error that occurred in this matter is a technical and unintentional violation of SDCL 1-25-1.1.

- 5. Based upon the materials in the record and the testimony presented at the hearing of this matter, the Commission concludes the Pierre City Commission did violate the South Dakota Open Meetings Laws. SDCL 1-25-1.1 requires publication of a proposed agenda on the political subdivision's website (if one exists) at least twenty-four hours prior to an official meeting. The Pierre City Commission failed to ensure that the proposed agenda for its April 7, 2020 meeting was published on the City of Pierre website for at least twenty-four hours preceding the meeting.
- 6. Any Conclusion of Law more appropriately labeled as a Finding of Fact is hereby re-designated as such and incorporated above therein.

## DECISION

Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the South Dakota Open Meetings Commission hereby REPRIMANDS the Pierre City Commission for a violation of SDCL 1-25-1.1 in that the City Commission failed to post a copy of the proposed agenda for the City Commission's April 7, 2020, meeting on the City of Pierre's website for an entire and continuous twenty-four hours preceding the meeting.

OMC 2020-04 Pierre City Commission Findings and Conclusions

Decision entered by Commissioners Reedstrom (Chair), Hoffman,

# Tracy, & Wendt.

Commissioner **Sovell** was absent from the meeting when the matter was heard and abstained from any final action taken by the Commission

# OPEN MEETINGS COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF OPEN	)	OMC 2020-04
MEETINGS COMPLAINT AGAINST PIERRE CITY COMMISSION – HUGHES COUNTY	) ) )	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that true and correct copies of the proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, & Decision, and Notice of Hearing issued in the above-captioned matter, were served by Federal Express Overnight Delivery upon:

Caleb Matthew Gilkerson 511 W. Dakota Avenue Pierre, South Dakota 57501

&

Lindsey Riter-Rapp 2301 Patron Parkway Pierre, South Dakota 57501

Dated this 28th day of December, 2020.

Steven R. Blair

Assistant Attorney General 1302 East Highway 14, Suite 1 Pierre, South Dakota 57501

Telephone: (605) 773-3215